In vitro Testing for Cobalt Sensitivity: An Aid to Diagnosis

NABIL G. AL-TAWIL, JAN A. MARCUSSON and ERNA MÖLLER

Department of Clinical Immunology, Huddinge Hospital and Department of Dermatology, Karolinska Hospital, Karolinska Institute Medical School, Stockholm, Sweden

Peripheral blood lymphocytes from 45 patients with a positive patch test to cobalt chloride (CoCl₂) and 37 controls were stimulated with various concentrations of CoCl₂ and/or cobalt sulphate (CoSO₄), or cobalt nitrate (Co(NO₃)₂) or cobalt acetate ([CH₃COO]₂Co) for various days in culture. Lymphocytes from 35 of these patients showed a significantly greater response than that of the controls. The response occurred in the T enriched population and was monocyte dependent. The strength of the in vivo serial dilution test results did not correlate well with the height of in vitro responses. Lymphocytes from 3 nickel and/or chromium sensitive patients failed to respond to stimulation with cobalt compounds thus confirming the specificity of the reaction. The DNA synthesis test seems to be a reliable in vitro method to aid in the diagnosis of cobalt sensitivity. Key words: Cobalt sensitivity; Lymphocyte stimulation; In vitro criteria.

Nabil G. Al-Tawil, Department of Clinical Immunology, Huddinge Hospital, S-14186 Huddinge, Sweden.

Cobalt is allergenic like nickel to which it is closely related (1). Most cases of cobalt sensitivity occur in association with nickel sensitivity in women and with chromate sensitivity in men (2). This is often due to concomitant exposure to these metals or their compounds (1). However, Rystedt (3) found it hard to evaluate the clinical relevance of cobalt exposure. The patch testing with cobalt presents problems and even with critical evaluation, about 10% false positive and 10% false negative reactions are probable (4). In this study we tried to ascertain whether the DNA synthesis test could be used to aid in the diagnosis of cobalt sensitivity and whether the cobalt compound-induced activation of lymphocytes is specific. We also tried to determine the type of cells responding to cobalt stimulation and whether monocytes are required.

MATERIAL AND METHODS

Patients. Forty-five patients with a positive patch test (+ + or more) to 1 % CoCl₂ were included in this study. They ranged in age from 17 to 81 years. Two patients with a positive patch test to potassium dichromate (K₂Cr₂O₇) and one patient with a positive patch test to nickel sulphate (NiSO₄) were also included to test for specificity.

Controls. Thirty-seven age- and sex-matched healthy individuals without eczema or a case history of metal contact allergy were included.

Patch testing was performed according to Pirilä (5). The conditions, time of exposure and reading of the test were as previously described (6). None of the patients had had active eczema for at least 2 weeks prior to testing.

In vivo serial dilution test (SDT) was performed using the following concentrations of CoCl₂ in distilled water: 0.5, 0.25, 0.125, 0.0625, 0.0312, 0.0156, 0.0078 and 0.0039 %, A ++ reaction or more with any of these concentrations was considered as positive.

Preparation of cobalt compounds and PHA. Stock solutions of 1% of CoCl₂·6H₂O (Merck, Germany), CoSO₄·7H₂O (Merck), Co(NO₃)₂·6H₂O (Merck) and (CH₃COO)₂Co·4H₂O (Merck) were prepared in distilled water. These solutions were then diluted with modified Eagle's minimum essential medium (MEM) (Flow Laboratories, Irvine, Scotland) giving final concentrations in culture.
Fig. 1. Time–response curve for peripheral blood lymphocytes from 35 patients with a positive patch test to CoCl$_2$ (x—x) and 37 controls (x · · · x) using 3.125 µg CoCl$_2$/ml culture. The mean increment counts per minute and standard error values are plotted.

of 1.5, 3.125, 6.25, 12.5, 25 and 50 µg/ml. Phytohaemagglutinin (PHA) (Wellcome) was added to a final concentration of 50 µg/ml as a positive control.

Mononuclear cell preparation and assay of DNA synthesis. This was performed as described previously (6). Monocytes were isolated by adherence to plastic and more than 90% of these cells ingested Candida. The non-adherent cell suspension was iron-treated and then fractionated into T- and B-enriched lymphocyte populations (7).

**Statistical method.** Student’s t-test was used. p-Values <0.05 were considered significant.

**RESULTS**

All the 45 patients showed a ++ reaction or more when patch tested with 1% CoCl$_2$. However, the in vivo SDT was negative in 14 of the 37 patients who accepted to participate. Forty-one patients were also nickel- and/or chrome-positive on patch testing.

Lymphocytes from 35 patients (excluding 10 patients, see below) gave their highest response on day 7 of culture when stimulated with 1.5, 3.125, 6.25, 12.5 and 25 µg CoCl$_2$/ml while lymphocytes of controls showed either a negative or a weak response (Fig. 1). Responses of patients’ lymphocytes were higher (p<0.05 or p<0.001) than those of controls when stimulated with 1.5, 3.125, 6.25 and 12.5 µg CoCl$_2$/ml on days 3–7 of culture and also when stimulated with 25 µg on days 3–6 of culture. Responses of lymphocytes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 1. Specificity of lymphocyte responses in vitro</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cells from patients with indicated metal allergies were tested with CoCl$_2$ and SI on day 6 of culture are shown. C = control.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expt. no.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
from individual patients were almost always higher than those of controls simultaneously
tested with any of these concentrations on days 3–8 of culture. Neither patient nor control
lymphocytes showed any response when stimulated with 50 µg CoCl₂/ml culture.

Lymphocytes from some of these patients and controls were challenged with various
concentrations of other cobalt compounds, CoSO₄ or Co(NO₃)₂ or (CH₃COO)₂Co for
various days in culture. The cells responded in a similar manner as when challenged with
CoCl₂ (data not shown).

From the above data it was possible to identify certain criteria that should be fulfilled in
order to define a positive response in vitro. Thus, positive reactivity is defined if lympho­
cytes when stimulated with 1.5, 3.125 and 6.25 µg CoCl₂/ml give stimulation indices of
more than one and greater than those of control lymphocytes simultaneously tested on
days 5 and 6 of culture. These conditions also apply when other cobalt compounds were
used.

To test the specificity of cobalt-compound-induced activation, lymphocytes from 3
patients with a positive patch test to K₂Cr₂O₇ or NiSO₄ were stimulated with various
concentrations of CoCl₂ for various days in culture. The response of lymphocytes from
these 3 patients failed to fulfill the above-mentioned criteria thus confirming the specificity
of the stimulation (Table I).

Lymphocytes of 9 of the 14 patients who had a negative response to serial dilutions of
CoCl₂ in vivo responded to stimulation with CoCl₂ in vitro and were included in the time
response curve, while lymphocytes from the remaining 5 patients could not be stimulated in
vitro. On the other hand, lymphocytes from 4 other patients who had a positive response
to the SDT in vivo failed to show a positive response in vitro. Lymphocytes from one
patient who did not participate in the SDT also showed a negative response in vitro.

Responses of lymphocytes from the latter 10 patients were thus excluded from the time-
response curve (see above). These results were confirmed by retesting lymphocytes taken
on different occasions from most of these patients. The patients' skin and lymphocyte
responses are summarized in Table II.

We could not find a good correlation between the strength of in vivo SDT results and the
height of in vitro lymphocyte responses (Fig. 2) to stimulation with 1.5, 3.125 and 6.25 µg
CoCl₂/ml on days 5 and 6 of culture.

Peripheral blood mononuclear cells from 3 patients with sensitivity to cobalt and from 3
controls were fractionated into T and B enriched monocyte-depleted populations which
were then stimulated with 3.125 µg CoCl₂/ml for 6 days in culture with or without
the addition of autologous monocytes. Proliferation occurred in the T enriched population and

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Patch test (1% CoCl₂)</th>
<th>Serial dilution test</th>
<th>DNA synthesis test</th>
<th>No. of patients</th>
<th>No. of controls</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>+</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>19</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>+</td>
<td>−</td>
<td>−</td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>+</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>−</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>+</td>
<td>−</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>9</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>+</td>
<td>nd</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>7</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>+</td>
<td>nd</td>
<td>−</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>nd</td>
<td>nd</td>
<td>−</td>
<td></td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Fig. 2. Absence of correlation between the strength of patients' responses to in vivo serial dilutions of CoCl₂ and the height of in vitro lymphocyte responses to stimulation with 3.125 μg CoCl₂/ml on day 6 of culture.

was dependent on the presence of monocytes. The results of one experiment are shown in Table III.

Lymphocytes from all patients and controls responded to PHA.

**DISCUSSION**

Cobalt metal itself sensitizes as do its salts and oxides (2). Cobalt sulphate was found to be a moderate sensitizer (grade 3 on a 0–5 scale) by the maximization test (8). Some investigators (9) used the leucocyte migration inhibition test to detect cobalt sensitivity in vitro and reported a 90% concordance with patch testing. Earlier, Veine and Svejgaard (10) detected transformation of lymphocytes in some cobalt sensitive patients and concluded that the clinical value of the in vitro test was limited but stated that a larger number of patients and controls must be investigated. In this study we challenged lymphocytes from

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Addition of</th>
<th>Cell suspension (cpm)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Subjects</td>
<td>M³Ô  CoCl₂</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Unfractionated</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Patient</td>
<td>– –</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>– +</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>+ –</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>+ +</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Control</td>
<td>– –</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>– +</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>+ –</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>+ +</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* 1×10⁵ cells/well.

* 5×10⁵ monocytes/well.
cobalt sensitive patients and from controls with different cobalt compounds and we could then define certain criteria for in vitro reactivity that can be used to assist in the diagnosis of cobalt sensitivity.

Combined reactions to cobalt, nickel and chromium are not uncommon and do not represent cross reactions but simultaneous, distinct and specific sensitizations (11). We have previously demonstrated the specificity of nickel (6) and chromium (12) induced activation of lymphocytes. Our results indicate that the cobalt induced activation of lymphocytes is also specific since the response of lymphocytes form nickel or chromium (but not cobalt) sensitive patients did not fulfill the criteria for in vitro reactivity to cobalt. The role of cobalt as a primary allergen must never be overlooked (13). Four patients (3 women and 1 man) had a positive patch test reaction to cobalt but not to nickel or chrome. The in vivo SDT with CoCl$_2$ was positive in 2 of them but was not done in the other 2. Lymphocytes from all 4 patients gave a positive response when stimulated with CoCl$_2$ in vitro.

The in vivo SDT is done if a patch test reaction is suspected to be of irritant type (1). Reactions to an allergen gradually diminish in severity, the weaker the solution while reactions to an irritant stop abruptly below a certain concentration and are likely to give irregular results (2, 14). In this study, however, we could not find a good correlation between the strength of in vivo SDT results and the height of in vitro lymphocyte responses since lymphocytes from some patients with a positive skin reaction to some or all dilutions of CoCl$_2$ showed weaker or even negative responses than those of lymphocytes from patients with a weak or even negative SDT reaction. The development of contact hypersensitivity reactions (e.g. a positive patch test) require sensitized T cells assisted by Langerhans cells, mast cells and basophils with the release of various factors (15). Langerhans cells were shown to take up cobalt, nickel and chromium in sufficient amount to permit specific histochemical visualization (16). We have demonstrated that a positive in vitro response of lymphocytes to stimulation with CoCl$_2$ as measured by increased $^3$H-thymidine incorporation is a reflection of proliferating T lymphocytes and is dependent on the presence of monocytes. However, Braathen & Thorsby (17) have shown that epidermal Langerhans cells are six times more potent than blood monocytes in inducing a NiSO$_4$-specific response of T cells from sensitized individuals. Thus, the type of cells in the skin as well as their number and potency may be different from those in the peripheral blood. This may explain the absence of correlation between the in vivo and in vitro reactions.

Patch testing can give false-positive or false-negative reactions (2). Lymphocytes from 10 of the 45 patients with a positive patch test to 1% CoCl$_2$ showed a negative in vitro response. The in vivo SDT was negative in 5 of them, not done in one but positive in 1–6 dilution steps in the remaining 4 patients. The positive SDT reactions in the latter 4 patients could have been due to hyperirritability of the skin.

The DNA synthesis test is a reliable in vitro method that can be used to aid in the diagnosis of cobalt sensitivity. In industry, it can be useful in some instances where patch testing with potential sensitizers should not be performed (1). Patch testing with CoCl$_2$ has been shown to induce sensitization (18). We have demonstrated that the in vitro lymphocyte response to stimulation with CoCl$_2$ occurred within the T enriched population and was dependent on the presence of monocytes.

Acknowledgements

This study was supported by grants from the Swedish Medical Research Council, the Finsen and Welander Foundations and Riksförbundet mot allergi. We are grateful to Mrs Birgitta Ånsehn for her excellent technical assistance.
REFERENCES